

Minutes
Historic Preservation Board
January 20, 2016 – 4 PM
City Commission Chambers
City Hall, Sanford, Florida

Members Present

Ian Carfagna, Chairman
Hank Dieckhaus, Vice Chairman
Cheryl Deming
Tammy Agnini
Ana Yebba

Others Present

Lonnie Groot, Assistant City Attorney
Mayor Jeff Triplett
Commissioner Art Woodruff
Commissioner Velma Williams
Russ Gibson, Director of Planning & Development Services
Christine Dalton, Community Planner/Historic Preservation Officer
Mary Muse, Administrative Coordinator

Mr. Carfagna called the regular meeting to order at 4 PM.

Minutes

Mr. Dieckhaus moved to approve the December 16, 2015 regular meeting minutes. Ms. Yebba seconded. Motion carried 5-0.

Public Meetings

PM-1 Hold a Public Meeting to consider a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows on the 1st floor (north and south elevation), and replace a door on the south elevation at 201 E. 10th Street.
Tax Parcel Number: 25-19-30-5AG-1202-006B
Property Owner: Scott Mason
Representative: Scott Mason

Mr. Dieckhaus moved to approve the request to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace windows on the 1st floor (north and south elevation), replace a door on the south elevation, and modify the porch spindles and rails by removing the boxed frame at 201 E. 10th Street based on a finding that the proposed scope of work is consistent with the purpose and intent of Schedule S, and complies with the design guidelines in Schedule S. Specifically, the new windows, doors, and porch rails/spindles are in character with the architectural style of the building and will not adversely affect the surrounding historic district. Ms. Deming seconded. Motion carried 5-0.

PM-2 Hold a Public Meeting to consider a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove a rear porch at 1100 S. Myrtle Avenue.
Tax Parcel Number: 25-19-30-5AG-1306-0010
Property Owner: Beach Quarters LLC
Representative: Susan Frison

Mr. Dieckhaus moved to approve the request to obtain a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove a rear porch at 1100 S. Myrtle Avenue based on a finding that the proposed scope of work is consistent with the purpose and intent of Schedule S, and complies with the design guidelines in Schedule S. Specifically, the porch does not appear to be original, is in poor condition, and removal of the porch will not adversely impact the architectural style of the building or the surrounding historic district. Ms. Agnini seconded. Motion carried 5-0.

PM-3 Hold a Public Meeting to consider a Certificate of Appropriateness to install an aluminum carport/awning in the service area adjacent to the alley at 120 S. Park Avenue.
Tax Parcel Number: 25-19-30-5AG-0304-0100
Property Owner: ROKA Properties, Inc.
Representative: Steve Smith

Mr. Dieckhaus moved to approve the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install a supported aluminum awning, with condition the aluminum columns be concealed with wood cladding and stucco, in the service area adjacent to the alley at 120 S. Park Avenue based on a finding that the proposed alterations do not conflict with the purpose and intent of Schedule S, as outlined in the staff report. Ms. Deming seconded. Motion carried 5-0.

PM-4 Hold a Public Meeting to consider a City Commission request; Denial Development Order pertaining; 119 S. Magnolia Avenue; Remedies Available to Property Owner
Tax Parcel Number: 25-19-30-5AG-0302-0090
Property Owner: Cindy Acosta

Mr. Carfagna read a letter into the record and requested City Commission receive a copy. He stated the letter is not for this particular item, but wanted to let the Commission know HPB has an obligation and a duty to stand up and protect the History, Character and Community Identity that the board and Schedule S were created for.

There was discussion regarding conversations between HPB members and City Commissioners, as well as advocating for or against applicants coming before the board.

During the review of this item Alec Then, Sara Jacobson and Mike Yebba came forward to speak. Mr. Then was concerned about what historic period the board was trying to replicate as well as any modifications being requested will not compromise the integrity of the building. Ms. Jacobson stated if the property owner did not do the work that was approved by city staff, why didn't anyone stop her during the work to advise her the work was not being done according to codes. She hopes the board can look at this situation and try to make it to where something like this would not happen in the future. The City needs to look at what is best for the downtown businesses and the downtown area. Mr. Yebba stated the applicant received public funds from a Façade Grant and a financial hardship should not be considered.

Staff distributed "before and after" photos identifying visible modifications made to the building. By consensus of the board, the following recommended remedy/remedies are to be articulated and transmitted to the City Commission for consideration at its appeal hearing on January 25, 2016:

- Item 1: Decorative trim detail modified.

The design of the decorative trim detail as shown in Figure 2.1 was acceptable provided it was restored with approved materials.

- Item 2: Original exposed structural header concealed with foam and stucco, extended to edge of building wall.

The modification to the existing structural header as shown in Figure 2.2 was acceptable but the westerly extension that was added on the south façade needs to be removed.

- Item 3: Trim concealed with stucco.

The area shown in Figure 2.3 has a vertical trim detail that separated the former transom windows and should be restored on the South façade. The front of the building or west façade should be restored with previous storefront windows, transom windows and trim detail.

- Item 4: Trim concealed with stucco.

Okay to leave area shown in Figure 2.4 as for the South façade only. The front of the building or west façade should be restored with previous storefront windows, transom windows and trim details.

- Item 5: T1-11 previously covering circa 1926 storefront windows concealed and/or removed; replaced with stucco.

Okay to leave area shown in Figure 2.5 as for the South façade only. The front of the building or west façade should be restored with previous storefront windows, transom windows and trim details.

- Item 6: Previously covered window opening concealed with stucco.
Okay to leave area shown in Figure 2.6 as is.
- Item 7: Recessed area from original door opening concealed with stucco.
Okay to leave area shown in Figure 2.7 as is.
- Item 8: Two shuttered window openings removed and concealed with stucco.
Okay to leave area shown in Figure 2.8 as is.
- Item 9: Door heights altered and new doors installed.
Okay to leave area shown in Figure 2.9 as is.
- Item 10: Trim concealed with stucco.
Okay to leave area shown in Figure 2.10 as is.

The HPB stipulated that any areas being modified must be with approved materials and also suggested that a contractor verify changes will not compromise the integrity of the building.

Code Enforcement Case Review

Ms. Dalton distributed a copy of the Historic District Open Case Report and the Historic District Fine Report.

Ms. Deming asked for a status on the Bishop Block awning item. Mr. Gibson stated he received a voice message from the contractor earlier, but has not had a chance to review it. The board requested staff to email them a status after the message has been reviewed. Ms. Deming stated if it is after the six month time period it needs to be turned over to the Magistrate due to the safety issue.

Ms. Agnini asked staff to check to see if there is a C of A for what appears to be porch repair at 1209 Oak Avenue.

Citizen Participation

None.

Staff Reports

Ms. Dalton asked the board if there would be any objection to changing the June meeting from the 15th to the 8th. Consensus of the board was to hold the meeting on June 8th.

Ms. Dalton commended the Deming's on the restoration work they did at 310 W. 6th Street.

Chairman and Board Items for Discussion

None.

Election of Chairperson and Vice Chairperson

Ms. Yebba nominated Mr. Carfagna to serve as Chairperson. Ms. Deming seconded. Motion carried.

Ms. Deming nominated Ms. Yebba to serve as Vice Chairperson. Ms. Agnini seconded. Motion carried.

Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 7:15 PM.


IAN CARFAGNA, CHAIRMAN